City Council Minutes

Workshop Meeting 06/19/89

City of Naples

City Council Chambers
735 Eighth Street South
Naples, Florida 33940

CC1176

-SUBJECT-	Page
PRESENTATION OF BOAT TRAFFIC STUDY BY HENIGAR & RAY ENGINEERING ASSOCIATES, INC.	1-7

City Council Chambers
735 Eighth Street South
Naples, Florida 33940

Time 9:00 a.m.

Date 06/19/89

Mayor Putzell called the meeting to order and presided as Chairman:

COUNCIL MEMBERS	MOTION	SECOND	VOTE YES	VOTE NO	ABSENT

Present: Edwin J. Putzell, Jr., Mayor
Kim Anderson-McDonald
William E. Barnett (left at 10:12 a.m.)
Alden R. Crawford, Jr.
John T. Graver ** AMENDED: Mr. Graver was absent. (07/19/89)
Paul W. Muenzer
Lyle S. Richardson, Councilmen

Also Present:
Franklin C. Jones, City Manager
Ann "Missy" McKim, Comm. Dev. Director
Jon C. Staiger, Ph.D., Natural Res. Mgr.
Paul Sireci, Police Captain
Jodie M. O'Driscoll, Deputy Clerk

*** *** ***

ITEM 1

PRESENTATION OF BOAT TRAFFIC STUDY BY HENIGAR & RAY ENGINEERING ASSOCIATES, INC.

Mayor Putzell advised that Henigar & Ray Engineering Associates, Inc., would be in attendance to present the Boat Traffic Study. City Manager Jones noted that the Citizens' Ad Hoc Committee had reviewed the study and prepared a report outlining their recommendations. He then introduced Gail Easley who was responsible for the project.

Project Manager Gail Easley stated that Consultant Jane Gray was also in attendance to offer highlights and answer any questions. The purpose of the study was to observe boat traffic in Naples, Dollar, and Rookery Bays as well as Rock Creek, Gordon Pass, and the Gordon River. Specific issues were observed such as: the Bay's capacity, various boat traffic components, future boat traffic and traffic patterns, as well as future water-related activities.

COUNCIL MEMBERS	MOTION	SECOND	VOTE YES	VOTE NO	ABSENT

Ms. Easley referred to Page 11 entitled "Data Bases Contributing to the Study", which outlined different components of the study. She noted that after observing the Bay's conditions at non-peak hours and attending the Ad Hoc Committee meetings, she was able to survey and analyze those results. She said Page 72 contained primary recommendations and the Decision Model in determining the level of service to be implemented.

In response to Councilman Crawford, Ms. Easley advised calculations have shown that at peak hours on the peak day, the level of service is "C". She suggested there be an 18-month sunset on these recommendations and an established period of time in which to verify those recommendations prior to continuing with Phase II.

Ms. Jane Gray the briefly discussed capacity relative to the number of boats on the Bay and its level of service. Capacity relates to actual number of boats, experience of crowded conditions, and general level of service experienced by boaters.

In response to Mayor Putzell, Ms. Gray advised that levels of service range from "A" through "F", with "A" emulating superior boating conditions and "F" indicative of unsatisfactory conditions. Level of service "A" through "C" are acceptable; however, "D" and "E" levels are approaching an undesirable capacity, and level "F" would not be acceptable at all. She said that capacity begins to deteriorate after level of service "C" is attained.

Ms. Gray confirmed for Mayor Putzell that the minimum water depth found in Naples Bay was two feet. Councilman Muenzer asked where the line had been drawn for north and south Naples. Ms. Gray advised that Page 47 delineated the channel boundaries and activity acreages for each segment based on survey results. On north Naples Bay, she said, 85% of the acreage was delineated for recreational boating, 15% for fishing activities,

CC1176

COUNCIL MEMBERS	MOTION	SECOND	VOTE YES	VOTE NO	ABSENT

which provided a total bay capacity of 220 boats. She said that data represented a level of service "C".

In response to Mayor Putzell, Ms. Gray advised the data used was based on a March 15, 1987, study. She clarified for Councilman Crawford that 14.4% of the traffic generated on that day was computed during the peak hour. Ms. Gray further stated that the peak hour ranged from 3:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m.

Ms. Gray said the study indicated that 80% of boat trips were associated with the Naples Bay channel, 45% with Gordon Pass, and 45% with Gordon Bay. She said thus far 235 boats have been established during the peak hour which equates to approximately 3% of the total registered boats in Collier County. A visual representation of the above was shown on Page 54.

In response to Councilman Crawford, Dr. Staiger advised that Coastal Engineering had taken data in 1986, 1987, and 1988. He noted that peak day data was taken in 1987 and pointed out that boat registrations have since increased from 4 to 5%.

Mayor Putzell said he believed increased boat population would result in additional burden to the Bay. Dr. Staiger, however, noted that the Ad Hoc Committee had agreed with the consultants that level of service "C" was a realistic estimate.

Councilman Crawford stated that he wanted to make sure that the information provided represents existing conditions. Discussion then ensued relative to the criteria used to determine the level of service and requirements to maintain each level. Mayor Putzell said he believed level of service "D" was indicative of the current situation on Naples Bay as it represents a poor level of service.

In response to Councilman Crawford, Ms. Easley explained that the determination for level of

COUNCIL MEMBERS	MOTION	SECOND	VOTE YES	VOTE NO	ABSENT

service "C" was based on calculations of non-channel capacity as well as other areas studied.

Mayor Putzell emphasized Council was particularly concerned with the channels as well as the Bay. Ms. Gray confirmed for Mayor Putzell that Henigar & Ray stood by its determination that the level of service would be "C" at peak hour/peak day. She reiterated that additional information has been provided for Council's review.

Councilman Barnett noted that the majority of complaints received were due to boaters not following navigational rules. Ms. Easley emphasized that management enforcement techniques should be in place on the Bay in order to enforce regulations.

By observing levels of service standards, a determination can be made as to whether or not the amount of boats would increase or decrease. The project indicates that boat registrations continue to increase thus decreasing the level of service. Ms. Easley noted that land uses surrounding Naples Bay, residential uses, marinas, boat ramps determine the kind of controls that must be in place to monitor those type uses. If a higher level of service was to be attained, changes in land use must first be implemented.

In response to Mayor Putzell, Ms. Easley explained that land would have to be down zoned. If the goal was to achieve levels "A" and "B" at peak hour, allowable land uses must be reduced and further management techniques must be recognized.

Ms. Easley stated that associated with the levels of service are management recommendations such as "Givens" defined on Page 31. "Givens" are programs that have been established by the City thus far. She suggested Council ascertain signage programs to meet the City's needs, and if necessary, additional signage be posted. Continued coordination with various law enforcement personnel is essential. She recommended a quota system be established in order

CC1176

COUNCIL MEMBERS	MOTION	SECOND	VOTE YES	VOTE NO	ABSEN

to launch boats to achieve level of service "A". A quota could also be considered as a shore line buffer to restrict uses to protect marine life and private property. She explained that there would be limited use in buffered areas which would parallel the shore line. Considerations such as noise, pollution, water quality, and water life protection must be taken into account when establishing a buffer area, she said.

If level of service "B" is desired, the shore line must be expanded and ordinances adopted to enforce the system. Certain restrictions in this level of service should be implemented such as limiting canoe travel and prohibiting fishing in Gordon Pass, Ms. Easley concluded.

In level of service "C", specified use areas would have to be established as well. She recommended coordination with the Department of Natural Resources (DNR) in regard to activities at peak hours; a self-imposed quota in launching of boats as well as slowing down minimum wakes. Captain Allen Richard of the Department of Natural Resources, she said, has recommended that down zoning and speed limits not be used as it is difficult to enforce them. Decreasing the minimum wake zone appears to accomplish the kind of management technique needed for the type system.

Referring to level of service "D", Ms. Easley stated that similar techniques apply; for instance, slowing down minimum wake at certain levels and times. She noted that elimination of a quota has been recommended for this level and suggested that local law enforcement agencies assist in extending that law. Increasing education, safety inspections, slowing down minimum wake zone at selected times are all recommended for level of service "E", she said. Ms. Easley reiterated that a sunset provision was recommended on whatever management technique was implemented.

Ms. Easley recommended that management techniques be implemented as boat registrations would

COUNCIL MEMBERS	MOTION	SECOND	VOTE YES	VOTE NO	ABSENT

continue to increase and noted that compared to the State averages, Collier County has a high ratio of registered boats.

Councilman Muenzer asked the definition of a "bay". Dr. Staiger explained that a Bay was confined on most sides by land with a definite mouth opening. Councilman Muenzer stated that most bays have wide mouths which originate from a wide body of water not like Naples Bay which is a narrow channel with speed restrictions and operation limitations, he said.

Mayor Putzell asked if it would be feasible to require everyone using the waterway to exhibit some certification as to vessel operation. Ms. Easley advised that could be accomplished by adoption of an ordinance. Enactment of such an ordinance would not affect the Intracoastal or DNR's regulations, she concluded. Natural Resources Manager Staiger advised the Florida legislature had adopted standard international and inland "rules of the road" in 1988. He further noted that the Police Department could enforce those regulations and cite violators for improper behavior. Mayor Putzell, however, stated he was merely trying to establish that education and learning techniques be studied prior to allowing amateurs the opportunity to navigate the Bay.

In response to Mayor Putzell, Dr. Staiger advised the report indicated that additional boat ramps and marinas were needed, however, environmental concerns relative to the same should also be seriously considered. He further advised that after the Naples Bay Watch Committee presents Council with its report, the Ad Hoc Committee would meet again to review those recommendations.

Mayor Putzell asked for clarification relative to the 12-month period recommended for Phase II. Dr. Staiger responded by advising that the Comprehensive Plan indicated costs for a one year boat traffic study at approximately $50,000 to $60,000. In response to Mayor Putzell, Ms. Easley said that she could not, at this time, estimate the costs to implement Phase II of the study.

CC1176

CITY OF NAPLES, FLORIDA

City Council Minutes Date 06/19/89

COUNCIL MEMBERS	MOTION	SECOND	VOTE YES	VOTE NO	ABSE

City Manager Jones said Council has been dealing with the issue in one form or another and noted that a definite decision would not have to be made immediately. It will take more work on the part of staff to resolve this situation and review the proposed management techniques.

*** *** ***

City Manager Jones then advised that a meeting had been scheduled with Dr. Michael Stephen of Coastal Engineering in Room 224 at 4:00 p.m. for those members of Council interested in reviewing the 1987 Dye Study of Naples Bay.

*** *** ***

ADJOURN: 11:30 a.m.

Janet Cason

EDWIN J. PUTZELL, JR., Mayor

JANET CASON
CITY CLERK

Jodie M. O'Driscoll
JODIE M. O'DRISCOLL
DEPUTY CLERK

Dalila Mendez
DALILA MENDEZ
CLERK-TYPIST

These minutes of the Naples City Council were approved on _____.

MEETING LOCATION CORRECTED 1/18/96

CITY OF NAPLES

CITY COUNCIL HEARING

Re: Sabal Bay
VOLUME I Pages 1 - 115

COPY

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Had in the above-styled cause on June 21, 1989, at Naples High School, 1100 22nd Avenue North, Naples, Florida, before Sharon K. Kelley and Joseph F. Sineno, Notaries Public, State of Florida at Large.

PRESENT:

EDWIN J. PUTZELL, JR.,
Mayor, City of Naples

KIM ANDERSON-McDONALD,
City Councilwoman

WILLIAM E. BARNETT,
City Councilman

MISSY McKIM,
Community Development Director

RUDD CRAWFORD,
City Councilman

JOHN T. GRAVER,
City Councilman

LYLE S. RICHARDSON,
City Councilman

DAVID RYNDERS,
City Attorney

FRANKLIN C. JONES,
City Manager

PAUL W. MUENZER,
City Councilman

JON C. STAIGER, Ph.D.,
Natural Resources Manager

COLLIER
REPORTING SERVICE

"Serving Florida's 20th Judicial Circuit longer than any other reporting firm" TM
Depositions • Trials • Hearings

2335 Tamiami Trail No., Suite 405
Post Office Box 266
Naples, Florida 33939

(813) 262-7113

Staiger Exhibit 1 1/11/90